

Admins - Demande #3187

Demande # 2979 (Fermé): Améliorer la délivrabilité de nos courriels

Mieux comprendre les erreurs emails

01/06/2018 19:16 - François Poulain

Statut:	Fermé	Début:	01/06/2018
Priorité:	Normale	Echéance:	
Assigné à:	François Poulain	% réalisé:	0%
Catégorie:		Temps estimé:	0.00 heure
Version cible:	Backlog	Temps passé:	0.00 heure
Difficulté:	2 Facile		
Description			
Depuis toujours, même en considérant l'infra correcte, on a énormément de deferred. Il faut étudier pourquoi car ça peut être le symptôme d'un soucis.			
Demandes liées:			
Lié à Admins - Demande #3021: Traiter les erreurs 5xx sur les emails		Fermé	14/03/2018

Historique

#1 - 01/06/2018 19:18 - François Poulain

Cf [#3021](#) pour les exemples.

#2 - 01/06/2018 19:18 - François Poulain

- Lié à Demande #3021: Traiter les erreurs 5xx sur les emails ajouté

#3 - 01/06/2018 19:19 - François Poulain

- Lié à Demande #3021: Traiter les erreurs 5xx sur les emails ajouté

#4 - 01/06/2018 19:19 - François Poulain

- Lié à Demande #3021: Traiter les erreurs 5xx sur les emails supprimé

#5 - 01/06/2018 19:21 - François Poulain

- Version cible changé de Backlog à Juin 2018

#6 - 28/06/2018 13:28 - Quentin Gibeaux

- Version cible changé de Juin 2018 à Été 2018

#7 - 06/09/2018 13:33 - Quentin Gibeaux

- Version cible changé de Été 2018 à Septembre 2018

#8 - 04/10/2018 09:55 - Quentin Gibeaux

- Version cible changé de Septembre 2018 à Octobre 2018

#9 - 08/11/2018 12:32 - Quentin Gibeaux

- Version cible changé de Octobre 2018 à Novembre 2018

#10 - 06/12/2018 10:25 - Quentin Gibeaux

- Version cible changé de Novembre 2018 à Backlog

#11 - 27/10/2019 14:28 - François Poulain

Un petit exemple d'analyse des deferred:

```
(April) root@mail:/var/log# zgrep -o 'status=deferred .* (in reply to RCPT TO command)' mail.log.3.gz | sed -e 's/[0-9]\+\.[0-9]\+\.[0-9]\+\.[0-9]\+/42.42.42/g' -e 's/(OverQuotaTemp|OverReceiveLimit|ReceivingRate)\[^\ ]* /\1 [ -- hashcode -- ] /g' | sort | uniq -c | sort -h
      1 status=deferred (host bouvarel.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.7.1 <vip.april.org>: Helo command rejected
```

: Host not found (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host dice.gorgu.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.7.1 <xavier.brouaux_gnu@m4am.net>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisting in action, please come back later (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host frmug.org[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.3.2 Service currently unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host genovagrup.com[42.42.42.42] said: 451 Temporarily unable to process your email. Please try again later. (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host ks.gibeaux.eu[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.8 <admins-auto-owner@april.org>: Sender address rejected: Domain not found (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host ks.gibeaux.eu[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.8 <redmine@april.org>: Sender address rejected: Domain not found (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mail.dalibo.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.0 <laura.ricci@dalibo.com>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisted, see <http://postgrey.schweikert.ch/help/dalibo.com.html> (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mail.dhensa.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.0 <gm@dhensa.com>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisted, see <http://postgrey.schweikert.ch/help/dhensa.com.html> (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mail.perfscript.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.7.1 Client host rejected: cannot find your reverse hostname, [42.42.42.42] (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mail.tedese.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.0 <justine.sauret@tedese.fr>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisted, see <http://postgrey.schweikert.ch/help/tedese.fr.html> (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mta6.am0.yahoodns.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 User is receiving mail too quickly tnmpmscs (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mx1.antispamng.mg.gov.br[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.3.2 Service currently unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mx1.comcast.net[42.42.42.42] said: 452 4.1.1 <gandg4me@comcast.net> too many recent messages; Try again later (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host mx2.ac-montpellier.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 451 4.7.1 Greylisting in action, please come back later (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host MX5.ARKEA.COM[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.0 <conseiller-credit-agricole@cmb.fr>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisted by Arkea-GreyLister for 60 seconds (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host MX6.ARKEA.COM[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.0 <conseiller-credit-agricole@cmb.fr>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisted by Arkea-GreyLister for 60 seconds (in reply to RCPT TO command)
1 status=deferred (host us2.mx2.mailhostbox.com[42.42.42.42] said: 454-4.7.1 <shweta@newsteadlab.com>: Relay access denied 454 4.7.1 Please see <http://support.mailhostbox.com/email-administrators-guide-error-codes/> for explanation of the problem. (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2 status=deferred (host alt1.gmail-smtp-in.1.google.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450-4.2.1 The user you are trying to contact is receiving mail too quickly. 450-4.2.1 Please resend your message at a later time. If the user is able to 450-4.2.1 receive mail at that time, your message will be delivered. For more 450-4.2.1 information, please visit 450 4.2.1 <https://support.google.com/mail/?p=OverReceiveLimit> [-- hashcode --] - gsmtp (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2 status=deferred (host cultureetliberte-moselle.com[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <contact@cultureetliberte-moselle.com>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2 status=deferred (host mailfilter.webguru.nl[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <cedric.brancourt@simple-system.fr>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2 status=deferred (host mx2.comcast.net[42.42.42.42] said: 452 4.1.1 <gandg4me@comcast.net> too many recent messages; Try again later (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2 status=deferred (host mx.mailprotect.be[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.7.1 <merijn.supply@vormingplus.be>: Recipient address rejected: Please try again in a few minutes - <http://www.combell.com/en/about-combell/contact> (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2 status=deferred (host us2.mx1.mailhostbox.com[42.42.42.42] said: 454-4.7.1 <shweta@newsteadlab.com>: Relay access denied 454 4.7.1 Please see <http://support.mailhostbox.com/email-administrators-guide-error-codes/> for explanation of the problem. (in reply to RCPT TO command)
3 status=deferred (host funraille.org[42.42.42.42] said: 451 Temporary local problem - please try later (in reply to RCPT TO command)
3 status=deferred (host mailfilter.webguru.nl[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <contact@simple-system.fr>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
3 status=deferred (host mxb.relay.renater.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 Not verified (in reply to RCPT TO command)
8 status=deferred (host mx1.grenode.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.0 <faquin@chaussette.sale>: Recipient address rejected: Greylisted, see <http://postgrey.schweikert.ch/help/chaussette.sale.html> (in reply to RCPT TO command)
53 status=deferred (host mail-fr.securemail.pro[42.42.42.42] said: 452 4.1.1 <infos@kecetop.fr> 4.2.2 mailbox full (in reply to RCPT TO command)
98 status=deferred (host acescore.org[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 <noreply@acescore.org>: Recipient address rejected: unverified address: mail transport unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
151 status=deferred (host webarero.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <francois.battail@webarero.fr>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2247 status=deferred (host alt1.gmail-smtp-in.1.google.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450-4.2.1 The user you are trying to contact is receiving mail at a rate that 450-4.2.1 prevents additional messages from being delivered. Please resend your 450-4.2.1 message at a later time. If the user is able to receive mail at that 450-4.2.1 time, your message will be delivered. For more information, please 450-4.2.1 visit 450 4.2.1 <https://support.google.com/mail/?p=ReceivingRate> [-- hashcode --] - gsmtp (in reply to RCPT TO command)
2649 status=deferred (host alt1.gmail-smtp-in.1.google.com[42.42.42.42] said: 452-4.2.2 The email account that you tried to reach is over quota. Please direct 452-4.2.2 the recipient to 452 4.2.2 <https://support.google.com/mail/?p=ReceivingRate>

```
le.com/mail/?p=OverQuotaTemp [ -- hashcode -- ] - gsmtp (in reply to RCPT TO command)
```

=> Le gros gagnant c'est google. Il faut baisser le taux d'envoi.

#12 - 27/10/2019 14:30 - François Poulain

Google nous dit «
"Vous avez atteint la limite d'envoi d'e-mails"

Ce message risque de s'afficher si vous avez envoyé un même message à plus de 500 destinataires, ou si vous avez envoyé plus de 500 e-mails au cours d'une même journée.

Lorsque cette erreur se produit, vous devez normalement pouvoir recommencer à envoyer des messages dans un délai de 1 à 24 heures.

Pour éviter que cette erreur ne se reproduise, essayez de créer un groupe Google englobant tous les destinataires du message et de lui envoyer le message en question.

» <https://support.google.com/mail/answer/22839?p=ReceivingRate>

#13 - 27/10/2019 14:41 - François Poulain

Ceci étant si on fait un

```
zgrep '450-4.2.1 The user you are trying to contact is receiving mail' /var/log/mail.log.*.gz | grep -o ' to=<[^@]*@gmail.com>' | sort | uniq -c | sort -h
```

on a des adresses qui ressemblent à des cibles de spam.

#14 - 27/10/2019 14:49 - François Poulain

Exemple

```
(April) root@mail:~# zgrep '450-4.2.1 The user you are trying to contact is receiving mail' /var/log/mail.log.3.gz | grep -o ' to=<[^@]*@gmail.com>' | sort | uniq -c | sort -h
      2 to=<xxxxxxx.xxxxxx@gmail.com>
     48 to=<perryanderson93@gmail.com>
    2199 to=<lmattowen458@gmail.com>
```

Dans un cas précis qui nous occasionne 2000 deferred, c'est sympa la source :

```
(April) root@sympa:~# zgrep -C3 sympa.1570650956.18561.118@april.org /var/log/sympa.log.18.gz
Oct  9 21:54:45 sympa wwsympa[18560]: info main::do_arc(2013-12, msg00140.html) [robot april.org] [session 96967344747430] [client 172.16.0.1] [list educ]
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa wwsympa[18561]: info main::do_subrequest(lmattowen458@gmail.com, ) [robot april.org] [session 68288801828590] [client 172.16.0.1] [list april-actu]
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa wwsympa[18561]: info main::do_subrequest(lmattowen458@gmail.com, ) [robot april.org] [session 68288801828590] [client 172.16.0.1] [list april-actu]
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa wwsympa[18561]: notice Sympa::Spindle::ProcessTemplate::_twist() Processing Sympa::Message::Template <sympa@april.org.1570650956.18561,2069/shelved:dkim_sign>; envelope_sender=sympa-request@april.org; message_id=sympa.1570650956.18561.118@april.org; recipients=lmattowen458@gmail.com; sender=sympa@april.org; template=sendpasswd; action=subrequest
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa wwsympa[18561]: notice Sympa::Spindle::ProcessTemplate::_twist() Processing Sympa::Message::Template <sympa@april.org.1570650956.18561,2069/shelved:dkim_sign>; envelope_sender=sympa-request@april.org; message_id=sympa.1570650956.18561.118@april.org; recipients=lmattowen458@gmail.com; sender=sympa@april.org; template=sendpasswd; action=subrequest
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa wwsympa[18561]: notice Sympa::Bulk::store() Message Sympa::Message::Template <sympa@april.org.1570650956.18561,2069/shelved:dkim_sign> is stored into bulk spool as <1.5.1570650956.1570650956.214996.sympa@april.org_s,18561,2123>
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa wwsympa[18561]: notice Sympa::Bulk::store() Message Sympa::Message::Template <sympa@april.org.1570650956.18561,2069/shelved:dkim_sign> is stored into bulk spool as <1.5.1570650956.1570650956.214996.sympa@april.org_s,18561,2123>
Oct  9 21:55:56 sympa bulk[18557]: notice Sympa::Spindle::ProcessOutgoing::_twist() Start sending message Sympa::Message <1.5.1570650956.1570650956.214996.sympa@april.org_s,18561,2123/s/shelved:dkim_sign> to april.org (priority 1) (starting 0 seconds after scheduled expedition date)
```

#15 - 27/10/2019 15:03 - François Poulain

Et vu l'heure, c'est ça :

```
(April) root@sympa:~# zgrep '09/Oct/2019:21:55:' /var/log/nginx/listes.april.org.access_log
172.16.0.1 -- [09/Oct/2019:21:55:56 +0200] "POST /wvs/subscribe/april-actu HTTP/1.0" 200 16223 "https://april.org/" "Mozilla/5.0 (Windows NT 6.2; WOW64; rv:31.0) Gecko/20100101 Firefox/31.0"
```

#16 - 27/10/2019 15:05 - François Poulain

On voit d'ailleurs qu'on a beaucoup d'amateurs qui souhaitent nous suivre :

```
(April) root@sympa:~# grep 'Oct/2019.*POST /wss/subscribe' /var/log/nginx/listes.april.org.access_log | wc -l
1137
```

#17 - 27/10/2019 15:13 - François Poulain

Le release actuelle de sympa ne contient toujours pas de jeton ou autre mécanisme anti robot.

https://github.com/sympa-community/sympa/blob/sympa-6.2/default/web_tt2/subscribe.tt2

#18 - 27/10/2019 15:43 - François Poulain

Du code récent introduit les jetons (cf patches 2c0e8109c3 36fedef2e4 b30815ce91) mais seulement pour un nombre limité d'actions :

```
our %require_csrf_token = (
  'add'      => 1,
  'del'      => 1,
  'move_user' => 1,
  'savefile' => 1,
  'setpasswd' => 1,
  'setpref'  => 1,
);
```

#19 - 27/10/2019 15:45 - François Poulain

Je vais ouvrir un bug upstream. Perso je ne vois pas bien quoi faire de plus.

#20 - 27/10/2019 15:55 - François Poulain

<https://github.com/sympa-community/sympa/issues/780>

#21 - 27/10/2019 17:00 - François Poulain

Sinon, sur un an on trouve ça :

```
(April) root@mail:/var/log# zgrep -h -o 'status=deferred .* (in reply to RCPT TO command)' mail.log.*.gz | sed
-e 's/[0-9]\+\.[0-9]\+\.[0-9]\+\.[0-9]\+/42.42.42.42/g' -e 's/(OverQuotaTemp|OverReceiveLimit|ReceivingRat
e) [^ ]* /\1 [ -- hashcode -- ] /g' | sort | uniq -c | sort -h
[...]
 1013 status=deferred (host mx1.free.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.3.2 local delivery server failure (#2) (in
reply to RCPT TO command)
 1035 status=deferred (host eforward2.registrar-servers.com[42.42.42.42] said: 451 relay not permitted! (in
reply to RCPT TO command)
 1038 status=deferred (host eforward3.registrar-servers.com[42.42.42.42] said: 451 relay not permitted! (in
reply to RCPT TO command)
 1151 status=deferred (host oasis-system.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 <noreply@oasis-system.com>: Recipi
ent address rejected: unverified address: mail transport unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1162 status=deferred (host eforward1.registrar-servers.com[42.42.42.42] said: 451 relay not permitted! (in
reply to RCPT TO command)
 1268 status=deferred (host mail.partifasli.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 <noreply@partifasli.com>: Recip
ient address rejected: unverified address: mail transport unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1381 status=deferred (host red.les-plans-voyages.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <apache@red.les-plans-voya
ges.fr>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1548 status=deferred (host mail-fr.securemail.pro[42.42.42.42] said: 452 4.1.1 <infos@kecetop.fr> 4.2.2 mai
lbox full (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1858 status=deferred (host mailfilter.webguru.nl[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <contact@simple-system.fr>: R
elay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1860 status=deferred (host mx10.yulpa.io[42.42.42.42] said: 451 relay not permitted! (in reply to RCPT TO c
ommand)
 1868 status=deferred (host bertel-numerique.re[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <responsable@libre.re>: Relay a
ccess denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1899 status=deferred (host mailfilter.webguru.nl[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <yyyyy.xxxxxxx@simple-system
.fr>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 1939 status=deferred (host mail.ben-ward.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 <noreply@ben-ward.com>: Recipient
address rejected: unverified address: mail transport unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 2456 status=deferred (host mx10.mailspamprotection.com[42.42.42.42] said: 451 relay not permitted! (in repl
y to RCPT TO command)
 3257 status=deferred (host backup.meetingpanel.com[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <april@adminsyst.paris>: Rel
ay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
 3568 status=deferred (host alpariblog.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 <noreply@alpariblog.com>: Recipient
```

address rejected: unverified address: mail transport unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
3900 status=deferred (host mta6.am0.yahoodns.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.2 User is receiving mail too quickly (in reply to RCPT TO command)
3970 status=deferred (host mta5.am0.yahoodns.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.2 User is receiving mail too quickly (in reply to RCPT TO command)
4023 status=deferred (host mta7.am0.yahoodns.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.2 User is receiving mail too quickly (in reply to RCPT TO command)
4901 status=deferred (host webarero.fr[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <xxx.yyyyy@webarero.fr>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
5324 status=deferred (host mcdanielsco.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.1.1 <noreply@mcdanielsco.com>: Recipient address rejected: unverified address: mail transport unavailable (in reply to RCPT TO command)
18689 status=deferred (host mx-aol.mail.gm0.yahoodns.net[42.42.42.42] said: 450 4.2.2 User is receiving mail too quickly (in reply to RCPT TO command)
39797 status=deferred (host mx.lautre.net[42.42.42.42] said: 454 4.7.1 <april@xxxxxx.lautre.net>: Relay access denied (in reply to RCPT TO command)
82873 status=deferred (host alt1.gmail-smtp-in.1.google.com[42.42.42.42] said: 450-4.2.1 The user you are trying to contact is receiving mail at a rate that 450-4.2.1 prevents additional messages from being delivered. Please resend your 450-4.2.1 message at a later time. If the user is able to receive mail at that 450-4.2.1 time, your message will be delivered. For more information, please 450-4.2.1 visit 450 4.2.1 <https://support.google.com/mail/?p=ReceivingRate> [-- hashcode --] - gsmtptp (in reply to RCPT TO command)
104799 status=deferred (host alt1.gmail-smtp-in.1.google.com[42.42.42.42] said: 452-4.2.2 The email account that you tried to reach is over quota. Please direct 452-4.2.2 the recipient to 452 4.2.2 <https://support.google.com/mail/?p=OverQuotaTemp> [-- hashcode --] - gsmtptp (in reply to RCPT TO command)

Une grosse partie vient de sympa, notamment from april-actu-owner@april.org.

#22 - 06/03/2021 17:23 - Quentin Gibeaux

@françois : l'issue est fermée, le bug est corrigé en prod ?

#23 - 06/03/2021 17:31 - François Poulain

- Statut changé de Nouveau à Fermé

Oui. C'est un peu un combat perpetuel mais je ne vois pas de raison de laisser ouvert. Le soucis sympa est certainement plus d'actu.